Contents

Submission No. 5	2
2 Youngs Lane / 26 Youngs Lane	2
Council's Recommendation:	2
1-3 Youngs Lane / 40A & 40B Molesworth Street	3
Council's Recommendation:	3
Submission No. 9 & 93	3
105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne	4
Council's Recommendation:	4
42-44 Simpson Street, East Melbourne	5
Council's Recommendation:	5
Powlett Reserve, East Melbourne	5
Council's Recommendation:	6
Darling Square, East Melbourne	6
Council's Recommendation:	6
56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne	6
Council's Recommendation:	7
186-196 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne	8
Council's Recommendation:	8
214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne	8
214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne Council's Recommendation:	
	9
Council's Recommendation:	9 9
Council's Recommendation:	9 9 .10
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra	9 9 .10 10
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra Council's Recommendation:	9 9 .10 10 11
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23.	9 9 .10 10 11 .11
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington.	9 9 .10 10 .11 .11
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation:	9 9 .10 11 .11 .11 .12
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne.	9 9 .10 11 .11 .11 .12 12
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne. Council's Recommendation:	9 9 .10 10 .11 .11 .12 .12 .12
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne Council's Recommendation: 75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington	9 .10 10 .11 .11 .12 .12 .12 .13
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne. Council's Recommendation: 75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington Council's Recommendation:	9 .10 10 11 .11 .12 .12 .12 .12 13
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne. Council's Recommendation: 75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington . Council's Recommendation: 75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington . Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 74.	9 .10 10 11 .11 .11 .12 .12 .12 13 14 .14
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne Council's Recommendation: 75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington Council's Recommendation: 50 Council's Recommendation: 50 Counci	9 .10 10 11 .11 .12 .12 .12 13 14 .14
Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 15. 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 23. 17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington. Council's Recommendation: 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne. Council's Recommendation: 75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington Council's Recommendation: Submission No. 74. 2-4 Park Street, South Yarra. Council's Recommendation:	9 .10 10 11 .11 .12 .12 .12 13 14 .14

CITY OF MELBOURNE

Council's Recommendation:1	5
No Submission1	5
191 & 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne1	16
Council's Recommendation:1	6

Submission No. 5

Submission no.	My recommendations		
5	(Error due to address issue)		
2 Youngs Lane is now 26 Youngs Lane, while nos. 1 and 3 Youngs Lane			
	now 40A & 40B Molesworth Street. All three graded 'C' in 2016 HPI, but		
	missing from the C258 HPI.		
	Add all properties to the C258 HPI with the updated addresses and a 'Significant' grading.		

2 Youngs Lane / 26 Youngs Lane

2 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne is listed in the Heritage Places Inventory (**Inventory**) (June 2016, as gazetted) and is graded 'C3'.

The property address, '2 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne', does not exist Council's Geographical Information System (GIS), CoMPASS.

The entry in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) for this property therefore appears to include a pre-existing error in the address of the land.

As the property address, '2 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne', does not exist in Council's GIS database, the property was not included in the exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258.

Having conducted a further investigation of this property address following feedback from Council's expert David Helms', the Building Identification Sheet (BIF) for this property has been located from the *City of Melbourne Heritage Review 1999 (Allom Lovell & Associates, 1999)*.

The BIF Sheet for this property, which identifies the heritage grading is 'C3', includes a photograph of the front of the building.

A desktop review of sites fronting Youngs Lane, North Melbourne has confirmed that the building photographed in the BIF sheet is in fact located at 26 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne, and is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO3.

The BIF sheet for this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting its location, is provided in **Appendix 1**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that this pre-existing error in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) be corrected in the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 by adding the following new entry (as shown below):



DM 11851367 Page 2 of 16

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Youngs Lane	26	Significant	-

1-3 Youngs Lane / 40A & 40B Molesworth Street

1-3 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne is listed in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) and is graded 'C3'.

The property address, '1-3 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne', does not exist Council's Geographical Information System (GIS), CoMPASS.

The entry in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) for these properties therefore appears to include a preexisting error in the address of the land.

As the property address, '1-3 Youngs Lane, North Melbourne', does not exist in Council's GIS database, the properties were not included in the exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258.

Having conducted a further investigation of this property address following feedback from Council's expert David Helms', the Building Identification Sheet (BIF) for these properties has been located from the *City of Melbourne Heritage Review 1999 (Allom Lovell & Associates, 1999)*.

The BIF Sheet for these properties, which identifies the heritage grading is 'C3', includes a photograph of the front of the building.

A desktop review of sites fronting Youngs Lane, North Melbourne has confirmed that the buildings photographed in the BIF sheet are in fact located at 40A and 40B Molesworth Street, North Melbourne, and are affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO3.

The BIF sheet for this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting its location, is provided in **Appendix 2**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that this pre-existing error in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) be corrected in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 by adding the following new entries (as shown below):

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Molesworth Street	40A	Significant	-
Molesworth Street	40B	Significant	-

Submission No. 9 & 93

Submission no.	My recommendations		
9 & 93	(Errors due to 'lost in translation' or address issues)		
	Change the C258 HPI for HO2 East Melbourne & Jolimont, as follows:		
	Add 105 Powlett Street as a Contributory place.		
	Change the listing for 42-44 Simpson Street to 66 George Street and		

DM 11851367 Page 3 of 16



Submission no.	My recommendations		
	move to the correct place.		
	Add Powlett Reserve and Darling Gardens as Contributory places.		
	Change 56-70 Wellington Parade to Significant and add 'Eastbourne		
	House' as the name. Add 8 & 10 Simpson Street as Significant places.		
	• Add the Greek Orthodox Church, 186 Victoria Parade, and the pair of		
	houses at 376 & 378 Victoria Parade as Significant places.		
	(Ungraded places)		
	As part of future work, undertake a thorough review of the Ungraded		
	places in the HO2 East Melbourne & Jolimont precinct, particularly interwar		
	flats. This should be done in conjunction with a review of the new precinct		
	citation to determine whether greater emphasis needs to be given to the		
	significance of flats within the precinct. Also give priority to review of the		
	following Ungraded places, which are potentially Contributory:		
	• 33 Albert Street, 18 Berry Street, 25-27 Burchett Lane, 28 Charles Street,		
	40 George Street, 10 Grey Street, 12 Lansdowne Street, 46 Simpson		
	Street, and Jolimont Railway Station 175 Wellington Parade.		
	• As part of future work, extend HO2 to include 8 & 10 Vale Street South		
	as Contributory places		

105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne

105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2, and is graded 'C2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne was listed in the Inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item</u> <u>6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16</u> with a Building Grading; 'Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No'.

105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne was not listed in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17);
- The corrected excerpt from the Inventory under Amendment C258 accompanying management's response to submissions (<u>FMC 20-Feb-18</u>).

105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 (e.g. 151 Gipps Street, East Melbourne), and is not included in an individual heritage overlay.

An aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting this property's location is provided in **Appendix 3**.

Council's Recommendation:

As a result of an error arising from a clerical mistake, the heritage place 105-109 Powlett Street, East Melbourne, appears to have been removed from the proposed Inventory under Amendment C258.

DM 11851367

Page 4 of 16



It is recommended that this error be corrected in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 by adding the following new entry (as shown below):

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Powlett Street	105-109	Contributory	-

42-44 Simpson Street, East Melbourne

42-44 Simpson Street, East Melbourne (address per Council's GIS database is 66 George Street, East Melbourne), is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2, and is graded 'D2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

42-44 Simpson Street, East Melbourne was not listed in:

- Attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;

This error was identified and corrected in the re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC</u> <u>21-Nov-17</u>), where the property '42-44 Simpson Street, East Melbourne' was listed with a proposed Building Grading; 'Contributory' and Significant Streetscape grading; '-'.

An aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting this property's location is provided in **Appendix 4**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the property address be altered in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 to reflect the primary address in Council's GIS database, in addition to providing the alternative address by adding the following new entry (as shown below):

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
George Street	66 (also known as 42-44 Simpson Street)	Contributory	-

It is recommended that the entry for '42-44 Simpson Street' be deleted from the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258, as shown below:

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Simpson Street	4 2-4 4	Contributory	-

Powlett Reserve, East Melbourne

Powlett Reserve (address per Council's GIS database is 72-74 Grey Street, East Melbourne) is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2, and is not graded in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

72-74 Grey Street, East Melbourne was listed in the Inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of</u> <u>FMC 5-Jul-16</u> with a Building Grading; 'Non-Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No'.

72-74 Grey Street, East Melbourne was not listed in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17);



DM 11851367 Page 5 of 16

 The corrected excerpt from the Inventory under Amendment C258 accompanying management's response to submissions (<u>FMC 20-Feb-18</u>).

Powlett Reserve is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay, with the exception of the 'Old Men's Shelter', a heritage place located to the north-west corner of the property, which is affected by HO128 and relates to a heritage place included on the Victorian Heritage Register (VHR No. H945).

An aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting this property's location is provided in **Appendix 5**.

Council's Recommendation:

The grading conversion methodology has been correctly applied for the property, '72-74 Grey Street, East Melbourne'.

No changes are therefore recommended to the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258.

As part of future work, Council will undertake a review of ungraded potential heritage places affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2, which will include appropriate consideration of Powlett Reserve and its heritage significance.

Darling Square, East Melbourne

Darling Square (address per Council's GIS database is 1-41 Darling Street, East Melbourne) is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2, and is not graded in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

1-41 Darling Street, East Melbourne was listed in the Inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of</u> <u>FMC 5-Jul-16</u> with a Building Grading; 'Non-Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No'.

1-41 Darling Street, East Melbourne was not listed in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17);
- The corrected excerpt from the Inventory under Amendment C258 accompanying management's response to submissions (<u>FMC 20-Feb-18</u>).

Darling Square is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay.

An aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting this property's location is provided in **Appendix 5**.

Council's Recommendation:

The grading conversion methodology has been correctly applied for the property, '1-41 Darling Street, East Melbourne'.

No changes are therefore recommended to the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258.

As part of future work, Council will undertake a review of ungraded potential heritage places affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2, which will include appropriate consideration of Darling Square and its heritage significance.

56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne

56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2.



DM 11851367 Page 6 of 16

There are several entries in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted), which provide gradings for buildings occupying the land at this address. These entries include:

- 8 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'A2';
- 10 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'A2'
- 12 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'C2'
- 14 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'C2'
- 16 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'D2'

No Wellington Parade street address is listed in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) for this property.

8 & 10 Simpson Street, East Melbourne are not listed in:

- The Inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>);
- The corrected excerpt from the Inventory under Amendment C258 accompanying management's response to submissions (<u>FMC 20-Feb-18</u>).

12, 14 & 16 Simpson Street, East Melbourne, are listed with a Building Grading, 'Contributory' and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' or '-' in:

- The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>);
- The corrected excerpt from the Inventory under Amendment C258 accompanying management's response to submissions (<u>FMC 20-Feb-18</u>).

56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne was listed with a Building Grading, 'Contributory' and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' or'-' in:

- The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258;
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>);
- The corrected excerpt from the Inventory under Amendment C258 accompanying management's response to submissions (<u>FMC 20-Feb-18</u>).

56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne is not included in an individual heritage overlay.

The Building Identification Sheets located for the buildings occupying 56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne, set out the following building grading's:

- 8-10 Simpson Street & 62 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne: 'A';
- 12-14 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'C';
- 16 Simpson Street, East Melbourne: 'D'.

The BIF sheets for the buildings at this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 7**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the entry for '56-70 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne', in the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 be corrected to include a serial listing of all of the buildings occupying the property that have individual heritage gradings, including 8 & 10 Simpson Street & 62 Wellington Parade, East Melbourne, as shown below:



DM 11851367 Page 7 of 16

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Wellington Parade,	56-70, includes:		
	62 Wellington Parade	Significant	-
	8 Simpson Street	Significant	-
	10 Simpson Street	Significant	-
	12 Simpson Street	Contributory	-
	14 Simpson Street	Contributory	-
	16 Simpson Street	Contributory	-

186-196 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne

186-196 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne is affected by individual Heritage Overlay HO183, and is graded 'A2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

Schedule HO183 provides the following description of the heritage place, '*Church of the Holy Annunciation Evangelismos, 186-196 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne*'.

An entry for '86-196 Victoria Parade' was listed with a Building Grading, 'Significant', and a Significant Streetscape grading 'No' or '-' in:

- The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17);

The entry '86-196 Victoria Parade' includes a typographical error, and should in fact read '186-196 Victoria Parade'.

An aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting this property's location is provided in **Appendix 8**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the entry for '86-196 Victoria Parade' be amended in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 to correct the address of the land, and to include the description of the heritage place, as shown below:

Stre	et	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Victo		186-196 (Church of the Holy Annunciation Evangelismos)	Significant	-

214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne

214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO2.

There are several entries in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted), which provide gradings for buildings occupying the land at this address. These entries include:

DM 11851367

Page 8 of 16



- 376 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne: 'A2';
- 376 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne: 'A2';
- 220 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne: 'A1'.

376 & 378 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne are not listed in:

- The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17).

214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne is listed with a Building Grading, 'Significant', and a Significant Streetscape grading 'Yes' or 'Significant' in:

- The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay

The Building Identification Sheets located for the buildings occupying 214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne, set out the following building grading's:

- 376-378 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne: 'A';
- 214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne: 'A'.

The BIF sheets for the buildings at this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 9**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the entry for '214-222 Clarendon Street, East Melbourne', in the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 be corrected to include a serial listing of all of the buildings occupying the property that have individual heritage gradings, as shown below:

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Clarendon Street	214-222, includes:		
	 214-222 Clarendon Street (Victoria House) 	Significant	Significant
	 376-378 Victoria Parade (Clontarf and Clonmel) 	Significant	-

Submission No. 15

Submission no.	My recommendations		
15	(Error due to lost in translation or address issues)		
	Review the potential inadvertent deletion of the Myer Music School, which		
	is included in the 2016 HPI with the address 75 Domain Street as a 'C'		
	Grade place. The correct address according to Land Victoria is 79 Domain		
	Street, as part of the corner site that also includes 3 Bromby Street.		



Submission no.	My recommendations
	(Ungraded places)
	As part of future work, review the following places, which are potentially
	Contributory to the HO6 precinct:
	92 Domain Street, South Yarra.
	100 Domain Street, South Yarra.

1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra

1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO6.

There are several entries in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted), which provide gradings for buildings occupying the land at this address. These entries include:

- 3 Bromby Street, South Yarra: 'B3';
- 75 Domain Street (Myer Music School MGS), South Yarra: 'C2'.

1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra is listed with a Building Grading, 'Significant', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' or '-' in:

- The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

75 Domain Street, South Yarra is not listed in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

It is noted that 69-77 Domain Street, South Yarra was listed with a Building Grading, 'Non-Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' in:

The inventory provided in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;</u>

1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra, is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay

The Building Identification Sheets for the buildings occupying 1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra set out the following building grading's:

- 3 Bromby Street, South Yarra: 'B3';
- 75 Domain Street, South Yarra: 'C2'.

The BIF sheets for the buildings at this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 10**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the entry for '1-7 Bromby Street, South Yarra', in the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 be corrected to include a serial listing of all of the buildings occupying the property that have individual heritage gradings, as shown below:

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape		

CITY OF MELBOURNE

DM 11851367

Bromby Street	1-7, includes:		
	3 Bromby Street	Significant	-
	 75 Domain Street (Myer Music School – MGS) 	Contributory	-

Submission No. 23

Submission no.	My recommendations
23	 (Errors due to address issue) Remove 17-21 Barnett Street (c.1970s block of flats) from the C258 HPI, as it is a Non-contributory place. Reinstate the former Uniting Church at 17 Brougham Street in the C258 HPI at least as Contributory and undertake a review to determine if it is Significant. (Incorrect grading) Change the grading of 91 Barnett Street in the C258 HPI from Significant to Contributory.

17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington

17-21 Barnett Street (address per Council's GIS database is 19 Barnett Street, Kensington), is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO1162 and appears to be partly graded 'C2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) (listed under 13-19 Barnett Street).

17-21 Barnett Street, Kensington is listed with a Building Grading, 'Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' or '-' in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

The Kensington Heritage Review 2013, listed the property as '17-21 Barnett Street', and identified that this property was 'Non-Contributory' to the heritage precinct and fronted a 'Level 3' graded streetscape.

An excerpt from the Kensington Heritage Review 2013 with the relevant entry highlighted, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 11**.

It is noted that the neighbouring properties to the north and south at 13 Barnett Street, Kensington and 23 Barnett Street, Kensington, respectively, have been correctly listed in the re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>) with a Building Grading, 'Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, '-', which is consistent with their identified level of heritage significance in the Kensington Heritage Review 2013.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the entry for '17-21 Barnett Street' be deleted from the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258, as shown below:



DM 11851367 Page 11 of 16

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Kensington Street	17-21	Contributory	-

9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne

9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO3.

There are several entries in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted), which provide gradings for buildings that formerly occupied, and currently occupy, the land at this address. These entries include:

- 9-11 Brougham Street, North Melbourne: 'D2'
- 13 Brougham Street, North Melbourne: 'D2'
- 17 Brougham Street (Former Uniting Church), North Melbourne: 'C2'

The property, 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne is listed with a Building Grading, 'Non-Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' in <u>attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16</u>, and is not listed in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay

Attachment 4 to Lovell Chen's Evidence for Council identifies the rationale for the property at 9-21 Brougham Street, North Melbourne being downgraded to 'Non-contributory', as due to the demolition of the Victorian terrace cottages that were the subject of the original grading in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

It appears that the Former Uniting Church at 17 Brougham Street, North Melbourne (which continues to occupy the north-west corner of the land) was inadvertently captured by this process.

The Building Identification Sheet and citation for the Former Uniting Church at 17 Brougham Street, North Melbourne, identifies that this building is graded 'C2'.

The BIF sheet for the Former Uniting Church at this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 12**.

Council's Recommendation:

As a result of an error arising from a clerical mistake, the heritage place 17 Brougham Street, North Melbourne, appears to have been removed from the proposed Inventory under Amendment C258.

It is recommended that this error be corrected in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 by adding the following new entry (as shown below):

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Brougham Street	19-21, includes:		
	 17 Brougham Street (Former Uniting Church) 	Contributory	-

75, 77, 79, 81, 83, 85, 87, 89, 91, 93, 95, 97 Barnett Street, Kensington

The following properties are affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO1162, and are graded 'D2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted):

DM 11851367

Page 12 of 16



- 75 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 77 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 79 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 81 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 83 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 85 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 87 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 89 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 91 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 93 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 95 Barnett Street, Kensington
- 97 Barnett Street, Kensington

The above properties were erroneously listed with a Building Grading, 'Significant', and a Significant Streetscape grading, '-' in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

The Kensington Heritage Review 2013, lists the above properties as 'Contributory' to the heritage precinct, and fronting a 'Level 2' graded streetscape.

An excerpt from the Kensington Heritage Review 2013 with the relevant entries highlighted, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the properties location, is provided in **Appendix 13**.

Council's Recommendation:

As a result of an error arising from a clerical mistake, the above heritage places appear to have been listed in the proposed Inventory under Amendment C258 with a Building Grading, 'Significant'.

It is recommended that the entries for the above properties be corrected in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258, as shown below:

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Barnett Street	75	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	77	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	79	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	81	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	83	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	85	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	87	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	89	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	91	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	93	SignificantContributory	-

DM 11851367 Page 13 of 16



Barnett Street	95	SignificantContributory	-
Barnett Street	97	SignificantContributory	-

Submission No. 74

Submission no.	My recommendations
74	 (Errors due to address issue) Incomplete address – In the C258 HPI add St Margarets to 2 Park Street in addition to 100-104 Toorak Road, and use the name 'St Margarets' to help identify both listings. Consider doing the same for all properties that have two street addresses. Remove Non-contributory 2-14 Hope Street from the C258 HPI.
	 Reinstate 'Fawkner Club Hotel, 52 & 52W Toorak Road West' as a Contributory place to the C258 HPI.

2-4 Park Street, South Yarra

2-4 Park Street, South Yarra (address per Council's GIS database is 100-104 Toorak Road West, South Yarra), is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO6, and is graded 'C2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

2-4 Park Street, South Yarra was not listed in:

- Attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17).

100-104 Toorak Road West, South Yarra was listed with a Building Grading, 'Significant', and a Significant Streetscape grading of 'No' or '-', in:

- Attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17).

100-104 Toorak Road West, South Yarra is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay

The Building Identification Sheet and citation for 2-4 Park Street, South Yarra identifies that this property is also known as 100-104 Toorak Road West, South Yarra, and that the building at this property, named 'St Margarets', is graded 'C2'.

The BIF sheet for the building at this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 14**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the property address be altered in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 to reflect the primary address in Council's GIS database, in addition to providing the alternative address and building name as shown below:



DM 11851367 Page 14 of 16

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
	100-104 <u>(St Margarets) (also</u> known as 2-4 Park Street)	Significant	-

2-14 Hope Street, South Yarra

2-14 Hope Street, South Yarra is affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO6, and is occupied by a building (the Fawkner Club Hotel) with a street address of 52-56 Toorak Road West, that is graded 'C1' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

2-14 Hope Street, South Yarra is listed with a Building Grading, 'Contributory' and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' or '-' in:

- Attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16; and
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258.

2-14 Hope Street, South Yarra is listed with the building name, 'Fawkner Club Hotel' in the re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (<u>FMC 21-Nov-17</u>).

2-14 Hope Street, South Yarra is not listed under any other address in any version of the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 and is not included in an individual heritage overlay

The Building Identification Sheet and citation for 2-14 Hope Street, South Yarra identifies that this property is also known as 52 Toorak Road West, South Yarra, and that the building at this property, named 'Fawkner Club Hotel', is graded 'C1'.

The BIF sheet for the building at this property, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the property's location, is provided in **Appendix 15**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that the property address be altered in the Heritage Places Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 to reflect the primary address in Council's GIS database, in addition to providing the alternative address and building name as shown below:

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Hope Street	2-14 (Fawkner Club Hotel, also known as 52-54 Toorak Road West)	•	-

No Submission

Submission no.	My recommendations	
-	(Error due to address issues)	
	Add 191 & 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne to the C258 HPI as	
Contributory places.		



DM 11851367 Page 15 of 16

191 & 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne

191 and 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne are affected by precinct Heritage Overlay HO3.

191 and 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne are not listed in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted), and are listed with a Building Grading, 'Non-Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' in <u>Attachment 5</u> to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16.

191 and 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne are not listed in:

- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17).

193 and 195 Errol Street, North Melbourne are graded 'C2' in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) and are listed with a Building Grading, 'Contributory', and a Significant Streetscape grading, 'No' or '-' in:

- Attachment 5 to Agenda Item 6.1 of FMC 5-Jul-16;
- The original exhibited Inventory under Amendment C258; and
- The re-exhibited corrected Inventory under Amendment C258 (FMC 21-Nov-17).

The Building Identification Sheets for 193 and 195 Errol Street, North Melbourne include photographs of each building at these addresses, and identify that each building is graded 'C2'.

The photographed building at 195 Errol Street, North Melbourne, has the address '195 Errol Street' painted prominently on its façade.

At some point in the past each building has been internally partitioned and subdivided to create 191 & 193 and 195 & 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne, which appears to have resulted in a pre-existing error in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted).

The BIF sheet for the buildings at these properties, and an aerial photograph and map from Council's CoMPASS database highlighting the properties location, is provided in **Appendix 16**.

Council's Recommendation:

It is recommended that this pre-existing error in the Inventory (June 2016, as gazetted) be corrected in the Inventory proposed under Amendment C258 by adding new entries for 191 and 197 Errol Street, North Melbourne, as shown below:

Street	Number	Building Grading	Significant Streetscape
Errol Street	191	Contributory	-
Errol Street	193	Contributory	-
Errol Street	195	Contributory	-
Errol Street	197	Contributory	-

